ACCELERATION: A POWERFUL EQUITY LEVER



THE CALIFORNIA ACCELERATION PROJECT CONFERENCE ON ACCELERATION IN DEVELOPMENTAL EDUCATION JUNE 24-26, 2015

Katie Hern CAP Co-Founder English Instructor Chabot College khern@chabotcollege.edu http://cap.3csn.org



What Can Colleges Do to Narrow Achievement Gaps for Under-Represented Students of color?

- Examination of disaggregated data to identify achievement gaps
- Learning communities targeting students in particular groups (e.g., Puente Project)
- Targeted support services and campus centers for particular groups (e.g., mentoring program for African-American males)
- Programs to orient new students' families to college life & expectations
- Graduation celebrations for affected groups
- Professional development for faculty/staff to improve institutional climate (e.g., culturally relevant pedagogy, equity-mindedness, assetbased teaching approaches)
- Curricula that feature diverse authors & multicultural issues
- Prioritizing ethnic/racial diversity in hiring practices

What Can Colleges Do to Narrow Achievement Gaps for Under-Represented Students of color?

- Identifying specific policies and structures in our institution that are producing inequities, changing them
 - Placement policies
 - Remedial course sequences

The Problem

In California, more than 75% of incoming community college students are designated "unprepared for college" in English, math, or both and required to enroll in remedial courses.

Student Success Scorecards show that these students have significantly lower completion rates than those classified as "college prepared."

Student Success Scorecard

Statewide

Click here to select a different college

	MOI	MENTUM POINT	S	C	OMPLETION	OUTCOMES				
PROFILE	REMEDIAL F	PERSISTENCE	30 UNITS	DEGREE/TRANSF		R TECHNICAL	EDUCATION			
Com	pletion							Clic	k here to vi	ew trend data
Percentag	ge of degree, cert or transfer-relate	ificate and/or tra ed outcomes.	nsfer-seeking st	udents starting firs	t time in 2007-	08 tracked for	six years throu	igh 2012-13	who comple	eted a degree,
				_	-	_				
COLLE	EGE PREPAR	ED	UN	PREPARED F	OR COLLE	GE	OVERALL			
		70.2	2%		40	.5%			48	.1%
Gender	%		Gend	er %			Gender	%		
FEMALE	73.2		FEMAL	41.7			FEMALE	49.2		
MALE	67.3		MALE	39.2			MALE	46.9		
Age	%		Age	%	_		Age	%		
UNDER 20	72.3		UNDER	20 42.7			UNDER 20	50.9		
20-24	60.1		20-24	31.6			20-24	37.2		
25-39	52.2		25-39	32.2			25-39	35.2		

The Unintended Consequence of Remediation Policies

The more levels of developmental courses a student must take, the less likely that student is to ever complete college English or Math.

Bailey, Thomas. (February 2009). Rethinking Developmental Education. *CCRC Brief*. Community College Research Center. Teachers College, Columbia University.

Disappearing Students: English-Writing in California

Students' Starting Placement English-Writing	% Completing Transfer-Level English in 3 Years
One Level Below	48%
Two Levels Below	34%
Three or more Levels Below	19%

Statewide data, Basic Skills Cohort Tracker, Fall 2009-Spring 2012

Disappearing Students: Mathematics in California

Students' Starting Placement Mathematics	% Completing Transfer-Level Math in 3 Years
One Level Below	35%
Two Levels Below	15%
Three or more Levels Below	6%

Statewide data, Basic Skills Cohort Tracker, Fall 2009-Spring 2012

Placement as an Equity Issue

Nationally, Black and Hispanic students are twice as likely as whites to have to take three or more remedial courses:

- 43% of Black and Hispanic students
- 22% of white students

2009 National Center for Education Statistics Witham, K.; Malcom-Piqueux, L.E.; Dowd, A.C.; & Bensimon, E.M. (2015). *America's Unmet Promise: The Imperative for Equity in Higher Education.* Washington, DC: the American Association of Colleges and Universities.

Placement as an Equity Issue

 In California, Black and Latino community college students are much more likely to be placed 3-4 levels below college math:

Black students:	61%
Latino students:	53%
White students:	34%
Asian students:	32%

 All students of color are much more likely to be placed 3-4 levels below college English:

Black students:	25%
Asian students:	19%
Hispanic students:	18%
White students:	8%

Perry, M.; Bahr, P.R.; Rosin, M.; & Woodward, K.M. (2010). Course-taking patterns, policies, and practices in developmental education in the California Community Colleges. Mountain View, CA: EdSource.

Outcomes for Students Placed 3 Levels Below in Math

Select College		Sele	ct Cohort T	erm	S	elect End 1	Term		Select B	asic Skills S	ubject	_
Cuyamaca		▼ Fall	2010		-	Spring 201	3	-	Mathem	natics	-	-
Select Starting Co	ohort Level	Cust	tomize coho	ort (Optional)							
tree Levels Below	v Transfer	-			-	٧	iew Report					
Export To ->	 Excel 	⊖ CSV	◯ Text		Records	Per Page:	10	•	• s	imple Layo	ut	nced L
Export To ->	Excel	⊖ CSV	◯ Text		Records	Per Page:	10	•	⊛ S	imple Layo	ut 🔾 Advar	nced L
Export To ->	Excel	⊖ CSV	◯ Text	Re	Records	Per Page: Format Are	10 Ba	-	⊛ S	imple Layo	ut 🔾 Advar	nced L
Export To ->	• Excel	O CSV	O Text	Re	Records	Per Page: Format Are	10 ea	•	⊙ S	imple Layo	ut 🔾 Advar	nced L
Export To ->	• Excel	⊖ CSV	⊖ Text	Re	Records	Per Page: Format Are	10 ea	•	⊚ S	imple Layo	ut 🔾 Advar	nced L
Export To ->	• Excel	⊖ CSV	⊖ Text	Rej	Records Port Data &	Per Page: Format Are	10 ea oring 2013	•	⊛ S	imple Layo	ut 🔾 Advar	nced L
Export To ->	Excel Three I	CSV	○ Text	Rej	Records port Data & F evels Below	Per Page: Format Are fall 2010-Sp Transfer	10 ea oring 2013 •• One Le	• evel Below T	⊙ S	imple Layo	ut () Advar	nced L
Export To ->	Excel Three L	O CSV	○ Text Transfer	Rej	Records port Data & F evels Below	Per Page: Format Are all 2010-Sp Transfer	10 ea oring 2013 One Le	• evel Below T	⊙ S ransfer	imple Layo	ut 🔾 Advar	nced L

Our Goals in CAP

To substantially increase the proportion of incoming students who complete college-level gateway courses in English and math and to narrow equity gaps between groups

Why this goal?

Studies have found this to be a critical early momentum point toward longer term degree completion & transfer.

Calcagno, J.C., Crosta, P.M., Bailey, T., & Jenkins, D. (2006). Stepping Stones to a Degree: The Impact of Enrollment Pathways and Milestones on Community College Student Outcomes. *CCRC Working Paper No. 4.* New York: Community College Research Center.

Attrition among Students Placed into Remediation: A Structural Problem

Students placed 2 levels below college English/ Math face 6 "exit points" where they fall away:

- Do they enroll in the first course?
- If they enroll, do they pass the first course?
- If they pass, do they enroll in the next course?
- If they enroll, do they pass the second course?
- If they pass, do they enroll in the college-level course?
- If they enroll, do they pass the college-level course?

Students placed 3 levels down face 8 exit points.

Illustration: Chabot College

Students beginning two levels below College English:

Do they enroll in the first course? ??%
If they enroll, do they pass the first course? 66%
If they pass, do they enroll in the next course? 93%
If they enroll, do they pass the second course? 75%
If they pass, do they enroll in the college-level course? 91%
If they enroll, do they pass the college-level course? 78%

(0.66)(0.93)(0.75)(0.91)(0.78) = 33%

Fall 2006 Cohort. Students tracked from their first developmental English enrollment and followed for all subsequent English enrollments for 3 years. Pass rates includes students passing on first or repeated attempts within timeframe. Basic Skills Cohort Tracker, DataMart.

A Thought experiment: What if more students passed the first course?

How many would complete the college level course?

(0.66)(0.93)(0.75)(0.91)(0.78) = 33%

If 75% passed the first course...

37%

If 80% passed the first course...

40%

If 90% passed the first course...

45%

What if 90% passed and persisted <u>at each point?</u>

(0.90)(0.90)(0.90)(0.90)(0.90) = 59%

BOTTOM LINE

Improving our results *within* the existing multi-level system will never be enough – we must eliminate or significantly reduce the exit points where we lose students in remediation.

Three High-Leverage Strategies

Changing placement policies:

Allowing more students to begin directly in college-level courses and making access to these courses more equitable across racial/ethnic groups.

Co-requisite models:

Students classified as "below college level" concurrently enroll in a college-level course and a remedial support course, saving them at least a semester of stand-alone remedial course work.

Accelerated remediation:

Multi-level remedial sequences in English and math are replaced with accelerated pathways, especially single-semester courses that are well-aligned with a college-level course and have no minimum placement test score.

Changing placement policies:

Allowing more students to begin directly in college-level courses and making access to these courses more equitable across racial/ethnic groups, by:

Adjusting cut scores

Using multiple measures more robustly

Using algebra-based testing and remediation only for access to math courses in the Calculus path Directed self-placement and/or other strategies?

Under-Placement into Remediation

Study of a "Large, Urban Community College System" Scott-Clayton, CCRC, 2012

Statistical modeling predicts

- 61% of assessed incoming students could make a C or better in college English if placed directly (19% were eligible by placement test cut-offs)
- 50% of assessed incoming students could make a C or better in college math if placed directly (25% were eligible by placement test cut-offs)

The Invisible Problem of Under-Placement

"When a student is placed into college-level course and fails there (an over-placement error), the fact that there has been a placement mistake is painfully obvious to all." But "when a student does well in a remedial course, it is unlikely to be perceived as a problem."

Judith Scott-Clayton, 2012

"Do High Stakes Placement Exams Predict Success?"

http://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/media/k2/attachments/high-stakes-predictsuccess.pdf

Placement in English:

How do we determine "college readiness"?

Sample Item: Accuplacer "Sentence Skills" Test

Writing a best seller had earned the author a sum of money and had freed him from the necessity of selling his pen for the political purposes of others.

Rewrite, beginning with The author was not obliged

- The new sentence will include
- A) consequently he earned
- B) because he had earned
- C) by earning
- D) as a means of earning

Alternative Placement with Multiple Measures Students qualify by test scores OR high school grades

Multiple Measures Assessment Project in California

Examined high school and community college transcript data from across the state and found that 72% of students could be placed into college English with an average grade of C+ using the following criteria:

- Overall high school GPA of B- or higher (2.7)
 OR
- C in AP English

OR

 Overall GPA of C+ or higher (2.3) AND 12th grade English grade Bor higher

Changing Cut Scores to Broaden Access: Butte College

Access to college English increased from 23% to 48% of incoming students

Completion of College English in One Year

- Tripled for African American students ($8\% \rightarrow 23\%$)
- Doubled for Hispanic students $(13\% \rightarrow 27\%)$
- Doubled for Asian students $(17\% \rightarrow 35\%)$
- 1.6 times higher for White students $(23\% \rightarrow 37\%)$

Old policy:

Whites' completion nearly 3 times higher than African Americans'

New policy:

There's still a gap, but whites' completion now just 1.6 times higher than African Americans'

Placement in Math: Are you "College Ready"?

/III. Exponents & polynomials

Simplify and write answers with positive exponents.

$$(3x^2 - 5x - 6) + (5x^2 + 4x + 4)$$

$$\frac{(2a^{-5}b^4c^3)^2}{(3a^3b^{-7}c^3)^2}$$

$$(3x^0y^5z^6)(-2xy^3z^{-2})$$

$$(-a^{5}b^{7}c^{9})^{4}$$

$$(4x^{2}y^{6}z)^{2}(-x^{-2}y^{3}z^{4})^{6}$$

6.
$$\frac{24x^4 - 32x^3 + 16x^2}{8x^2}$$

7.
$$(x^2 - 5x)(2x^3 - 7)$$

8.
$$\frac{26a^2b^{-5}c^9}{-4a^{-6}bc^9}$$

9.
$$(5a+6)^2$$

A Pathways Approach in Math

Traditional math remediation:

All students must test out of -- or make it through -- the remedial algebra sequence, regardless of its relevance to their intended program of study

A pathways approach:

Colleges begin by asking *which* college-level math students will take for their program of study and whether algebra needed to be successful there.

Gross Curricular Misalignment between algebra and statistics

Algebra Skills needed for Statistics

Table of Contents from a traditional Elementary & Intermediate Algebra text Chapter 11: Quadratic Equations and Inequalities . Chapter 6: Exponents and Polynomials Chapter 1: Some Basic Concepts of Arithmetic and Algebra = 11.1: Complex Numbers (21) = 6.1: Addition and Subtraction of Polynomials (20) = 1.1. Numerical and Algebraic Expressions (23) = 11.2: Quadratic Equations (20) + 6.2. Multiplying Monomials (22) = 1.2: Prime and Composite Numbers (20) = 11.3: Completing the Square (21) * 6.3: Multiplying Polynomials (22) = 1.3: Integers: Addition and Subtraction (25) = 11.4: Quadratic Formula (22) = 6.4: Dividing by Monomials (20) = 1.4: Integers: Multiplication and Division (21) 11.5: More Quadratic Equations and Applications (22) = 6.5: Dividing by Binomials (20) = 1.5: Use of Properties (21) # 11.6: Quadratic and Other Nonlinear Inequalities (40) = 6.6: Zero and Negative Integers as Exponents (21) - Chapter 2: The Real Numbers Chapter 12: Coordinate Geometry: Lines, Parabolas, Circles, Ellipses, and Hyperbolas * 2.1: Rational Numbers: Multiplication and Division (20) . Chapter 7: Factoring, Solving Equations, and Problem Solving * 12.1: Distance, Slope, and Graphing Techniques (24) = 7.1: Factoring by Using the Districutive Property (21) = 2.2 Rational Numbers' Addition and Subtraction (21) + 12.2: Graphing Parabolas (20) = 7.2: Factoring the Difference of Two Squares (22) 2.3: Real Numbers and Algebraic Expressions (21) = 12.3: More Parabolas and Some Circles (20) = 7.3: Factoring Trinomials to the Form x (to the 2nd) + bx + c # 2.4: Exponents (22) + 12.4. Graphing Ellipses (20) = 7.4: Factoring Trinomials of the Form ax (to the 2nd) + bx + = 2.5: Translating from English to Algebra (22) # 7.5 Factoring, Solving Equations, and Problem Solving (20) = 12.5: Graphing Hyperbolas (17) . Chapter 3: Equations, Inequalities, and Problem Solving . Chapter 8: A Transition from Elementary Algebra to Intermedia . Chapter 13: Function = 3.1. Solving First-Degree Equations (20) + 13.1: Relations and Functions (21) = 8.1: Equations: A Brief Review (20) * 3.2: Equations and Problem Solving (21) = 13.2. Functions: Their Graphs and Applications (19) = 8.2. Inequalities: A Brief Review (36) = 3.3. More on Solving Equations and Problem Solving (23) = 8.3: Equations and Inequalities Involving Absolute Value (34 = 13.3. Graphing Made Easy Via Transformations (20) * 3.4: Equations Involving Parentheses and Fractional Forms (2 # 8.4; Polynomials: A Brief Review and Binomial Expansions (13.4: Composition of Functions (20) + 3.5: Inequalities (21) * 8.5: Dividing Polynomails: Synthetic Division (20) # 13.5: Direct Variation and Inverse Variation (20) * 3.6. Inequalities, Compound Inequalities, and Problem Solving # 8.6: Factoring: A Vrief Review and a Step Further (20) . Chapter 14: Exponential and Logarithmic Functions . Chapter 4: Formulas and Problem Solving = 14.1: Exponents and Exponential Functions (25) Chapter 9: Rational Expressions * 4.1: Ratio, Proportion, and Percent (21) * 9.1: Simplifying Rational Expressions (21) = 14.2: Applications of Exponential Functions (28) # 4.2. More on Percents and Problem Solving (20) = 9.2: Multiplying and Dividing Rational Expressions (21) = 14.3: Inverse Functions (22) + 4.3: Formulas: Geometric and Others (21) + 9.3: Adding and Subtracting Rational Expressions (20) = 14.4: Logarithms (33) = 4.4: Problem Solving (20) = 9.4. More on Rational Expressions and Complex Fractions (= 14.5: Logarithmic Functions (28) * 4.5: More About Problem Solving (23) 9.5: Equations Containing Rational Expressions (21) 14.6 Exponential Equations, Logarithmic Equations, and Problem Solving (30) = 9.6. More on Rational Equations and Applications (20) Chapter 5: Coordinate Geometry and Linear Systems . Chapter 15: Systems of Equations: Matrices and Determinants 5.1: Cartesian Coordinate System (22) = 15.1: Systems of Two Linear Equations: A Brief Review (20) Chapter 10: Exponents and Radicals = 5.2 Graphing Linear Equations (20) = 10.1: Integral Exponents and Scientific Notation Revisited (L = 15.2: Systems of Three Linear Equations in Three Variables (23) = 5.3: Slope of a Line (22) = 10.2 Roots and Radicals (20) = 15.3. A Matrix Approach to Solving Systems (20) 5.4 Writing Equations of Lines (21) = 10.3. Simplifying and Combining Radicals (21)

- * 5.5: Systems of Two Linear Equations (25)
- * 5.6: Elimination-by-Addition Method (20)
- = 5.7: Graphing Linear Inequalities (19)

- = 10.4: Products and Quotients of Radicals (20)
- = 10.5. Radical Equations (19)
- = 10.6: Merging Exponents and Roots (20)

- = 15.4: Determinants (23)
- = 15.5: Cramer's Rule (22)
- * 15.6. Systems Involving Nonlinear Equations (20)

Virginia Community College System

A new placement test and different math competencies set for entry into college math for different academic paths (intermediate algebra only required for STEM programs)

Prior to the change, 19% qualified for college math.
 After the change, 43% qualified

Three times as many students completed college math in their first year.

Investigating Your Local Placement Policies

- What % of incoming students qualify for direct access to college-level English and math?
- How does this vary by race/ethnicity?
- To what extent is placement determined by students' score on Accuplacer/Compass/other test?
- Are multiple measures used in placement, especially overall high school GPA? If so, what % of students benefit from higher placement with multiple measures?
- Is a student's educational goal part of math placement? Are algebra tests blocking access to courses that require little to no algebra? (e.g, College Statistics)

Co-requisite models

Students classified as "below college level" concurrently enroll in a college-level course and a remedial support course, saving them at least a semester of stand-alone remedial course work.

Co-Requisite Models Instead of stand-alone remedial courses

ALP, Community College of Baltimore County Completion of College English



White students' completion 1.4 times higher than Blacks' in traditional developmental path – gap shrinks to 1.2 in ALP

Co-Requisite Models

Instead of stand-alone remedial courses

Randomized, controlled experiment with 721 CUNY students who placed into elementary algebra assigned to one of three treatments:

- Elementary algebra: 38% passed
- Elementary algebra with SI support: 45% passed
- College Statistics with SI support: 56% passed

One subgroup passed statistics at a rate of 68%. This group included students with placement test scores that would have placed them into pre-algebra at Santa Rosa JC (3 levels below college math).

Accelerated remediation:

Multi-level remedial sequences in English and math are replaced with accelerated pathways, especially singlesemester courses that are well-aligned with a college-level course and have no minimum placement test score.

In math, this means tailoring remediation to the students' intended program of study (e.g., pre-Statistics course).

The California Acceleration Project Supporting Colleges Statewide

59 colleges have worked with CAP to offer English and Statistics pathways that

- Reduce students' time in remediation by at least a semester
- Align remediation with college-level requirements, including offering a redesigned pathway for students taking Statistics
- Use high-challenge, high-support pedagogy
- Make no changes to rigorous, transfer-level course (only remediation is changed)

CAP Evaluation by the RP Group

Examined the first 16 colleges offering accelerated pathways with CAP, using statistical methods to control for pre-existing differences in student characteristics. Key findings:

- Students' odds of completing college English were 2.3 times greater in high-impact models of acceleration than students in traditional remediation.
- Students odds of completing a transferable math course were 4.5 times greater in accelerated statistics pathways than in traditional remediation.

Eliminating Achievement Gaps in CAP Math Pathways Completion of Transfer-Level Math within 1.5-2 years (Follow up analysis by RP Group -- descriptive data, no statistical controls)







Placement & Remediation Reform: A Powerful, Under-Utilized Equity Lever

- Students of color are being disproportionately placed into multiple semesters of remediation based upon standardized tests that bear very little relation to their ability to succeed in college-level courses.
- Each layer of remediation required reduces a student's chance of completing college-level English and math and making progress toward degree/transfer.
- Reforms that enable students to avoid or accelerate remediation are producing large gains in student completion and narrowing achievement gaps.

We must "be willing to disrupt the current systems of higher education and take responsibility for those aspects of inequality that are under our control."

> Researchers from the Center for Urban Education America's Unmet Promise

AAC&U